Willapa Bay Policy Review: Summary Descriptions and Analysis of Alternatives

	Alternative 1	Alternative 2	Alternative 3	Replacement Alternative 3 Language	Comment	
	Pure Status Quo	Fish Committee	October 27 Draft Staff	October 27 Draft Staff		
	2015 Willapa Bay Policy ¹	Draft Alternative ²	Recommendation ³	Recommendation ³		
Brief Description of Alternative	Manage for wild fish with reduced fisheries; fall chinook sport fishery priority and commercial priority for coho	Manage for a mix of hatchery and wild fish and meaningful fisheries	Wild/hatchery mgmt specifics deferred to 3624 process; near- Alternative 1 specifics on fisheries mgmt.	Operate hatcheries in a manner that optimally achieves conservation and recovery of wild fish while providing sustainable and stable fisheries	from C-3624	
Wild Fish Management Strategies	Wild Fish Management Strategies HSRG protocols		Deferred to 3624 process	Balance between minimizing genetic and ecological risks to wild populations and providing for the ecological and societal benefits of hatchery production	from C-3624	
Hatchery Program Size Goal						
fall chinook	Forks Creek: 0.35 M Nemah: 3.3 M Naselle: 0.8 M TOTAL: 4.45 M	Forks Creek: 3.5+ M Nemah: TBD M Naselle: 5+ M TOTAL: Minimum 8.5 M	Deferred to 3624 process	Forks Creek: 0.4 M Nemah: 3.3 M Naselle: 5.0 M TOTAL: 8.7 M	keep current releases until HMP	
coho	coho No size goal specified		Deferred to 3624 process	1.7 M Willapa Bay wide	keep current releases until HMP	
chum None; experiments possible		Nemah Hatchery only: 2+ M	Deferred to 3624 process	Forks Creek: 0.5 M Nemah: 1.5 M Naselle: 0.5 M TOTAL: 2.5 M	keep current releases until HMP	
Fishery Management Controls						
Rebuilding Program	16-21 year rebuilding program for fall chinook (2015 start)	No rebuidling program; manage to escapement goals	Continue 2015 rebuilding pgm for fall chinook	Continue 2015 rebuilding pgm for fall chinook AND manage to escapement goals, as highlighted below	from revised policy	
Take Limits	Fall chinook in-Bay limit of 14%; escapement goal based for coho with <10% incidental limit; chum limit of 5% - 33%	Take limits based on pre-season forecasts and spawning escpement goals; incidental take rates TBD when < forecast	When < escapement goal: Fall chinook in-Bay limit of 20%, 10% for coho, 5-10% for chum; all subject to 3/5 previous yr feature	same		
Sport & Commercial fishery allocation	coho and chum: commercial	"first and last crack" for rec; no specific alloc; relaxed time/area controls	The same general priorities but with relaxed area/date controls except north-bay areas (2T, 2U)	same		
Miscellaneous	natural spawner goal reviews	Experimental approach for wild hatchery fall chinook mgmt.; new Alt gear approach	Anything?	Natural spawner goals review completed for Chinook and chum. Work on review for coho. Adherance to C-3624, with hatchery management values explicitly expressed		

Willapa Bay Policy Review: Description and Analysis of Alternatives

Alternative 1						
Pure Status Quo						
2015 Willapa Bay Policy ¹						

Alternative 2					
Fish Committee					
Draft Alternative ²					

Alternative 3	Replacement Alternative 3 Language					
October 27 Draft Staff	October 27 Draft Staff					
Recommendation ³	Recommendation ³					

High Level Analysis of Alternatives

hatchery programs in 2022 and beyond	Forks Ck	Nemah	<u>Naselle</u>	Forks Ck	Nemah	<u>Naselle</u>	Forks Ck	<u>Nemah</u>	<u>Naselle</u>	Forks Ck	Nemah	<u>Naselle</u>
fall chinook	0.35 M	3.3 M	0.8 M	3.5+ M	3.3 M	5 M	unknown		0.4 M	3.3 M	5 M	
coho	300 K	0	1.4 M	TBD	TBD	TBD	unknown		1.7 M Willapa Bay wide			
chum	experimental only		0	2 M	0		unknown		0.5M	1.5 M	0.5 M	
Average take in fisheries after after implementation (year 5 and later)	show averages for each species		show averages for each species		show averages for each species		same					
commercial												
Status of wild fish populations at point of 2015 rebuilding plan target date (2033)	show Willana Bay aggregates and		show Willapa Bay aggregates and river by river data		show Willapa Bay aggregates and river by river data			same				
fall chinook												_
coho												
chum												

¹ https://wdfw.wa.gov/about/commission/policies/willapa-bay-salmon-management

² See December 2, 2021 Fish Committee draft for concepts and language drafting assignments to staff.

³ See staff draft presented at the November 2, 2021 Fish Committee meeting